

MAG Domestic Violence Council
Meeting Minutes
December 5, 2000

MEMBERS ATTENDING

Tom Ambrose, Phoenix Suns
Tracy Bame, Phelps Dodge Corp.
Elizabeth Reich, Governor's Division of
Domestic Violence Prevention
*Judge Jean Baxter, Glendale City Court
Peggy Bilsten, Councilmember of Phoenix
*Dr. Mary Ellen Bradshaw, Az Public
Health Assoc.
Donna Marcum for Mike Branham,
Criminal Justice Commission
*Jan Brewer, Maricopa County Supervisor
Tom Canasi, City of Tempe
*Michael Carey, Buckeye Police Dept.
*Maggie Cathey, Vice Mayor, Town of
Gilbert
Dean Coonrod, Maricopa Integrated Health
Systems/Medpro
*Sandy Cowen Miller, The Cowen Agency
Gene D'Adamo, The Arizona Republic
Lydia Carbone for Sheila Day-Geary, John
C. Lincoln Hospital
*David Easchief, Salt River Pima Maricopa
Indian Community
Hon. Susan Ehrlich, Arizona Supreme Court
of Appeals
*Dr. Paul Eppinger, Arizona Ecumenical
Council
*Mike Evans, Councilmember of Gilbert
Kathleen Ferraro, ASU
*Margarita Garcia, Councilmember of
Guadalupe
*David Goulet, Councilmember of Glendale
Cmdr. Kim Humphrey, Az. Regional
Community Policing Inst.
Roger Illingworth, Dept. Of Public Safety
Dyanne Greer, Maricopa County Attorney's
Office
Mary Lynn Kasunic, Area Agency on Aging
Loren Kirkeide, SRP

*Sanford Kravitz, Arizona Community
Foundation
John Leach, City of Goodyear
Rev. Deborah Lerner, Paradise Valley
United Methodist
Marie Lopez-Rogers, Councilmember of
Avondale
Cynthia Lukas, Councilmember of
Scottsdale
JoEllen Lyn, American Express
Preston McMurry, McMurry Publishing
Carolyn McBurney, 3TV/KTVK
*Laura Miller, Attorney Generals Office
Shillana Bowen for Rick Miller, Violence
Prevention Initiative
Shelly Hornback for Stephanie Orr, Center
Against Sexual Abuse
Paul Oves, Tosco Marketing Company
Rev. Fran Park, NW Valley Community
Council
*Janice Parker, Save the Family Foundation
*David Petersen, Arizona State Senate
Don Peyton, City of Phoenix Fire Dept.
Connie Phillips, Sojourner Center
Angie Rodgers, Children's Action Alliance
Dr. Lawrence Sands, Maricopa Cnty Dept.
of Public Health
*Joan Shafer, Mayor of Surprise
*Marie Sullivan, AZ Womens Education
and Employment
Lt. Louie Tovar, Domestic Violence Unit,
Phoenix, P.D.
*Margaret Trujillo, Value Options
*Roberta Voss, Arizona House of
Representatives
Mary Wambach, Arizona Coalition Against
Domestic Violence
John Pombier for Kerry G. Wangberg, Law
Department/ Criminal Division

Phillip Westbrooks, Councilmember of
Chandler

**Those members neither present nor
represented by proxy.*

OTHERS PRESENT

Linda Kmetz, MAG Associate
Jill Favor, AZ Foundation for Women
Sammy Lazarus, Northwest Community
Council
Claudia Claunch, Town of Carefree
Paul Denial, New Life Center
Patricia Klahr, Chrysalis Center
Cindy Blitz, Chrysalis Center
Jenni Gunderson, Family Advocacy Center
Lee San Miguel, City of Avondale
Laura Guild, DES, CSA
Sara Tabor, DES, CSA
Jennifer Murray, MCAO
Katie Hobbs, Sojourner Center
Lynn Potts, City of Mesa
Debbie Enis, Westside Food Bank
Mario Paniagva, FAC
Lyn Timmons, City of Phoenix.
Carol Kratz, MAG
Suzanne Quigley, MAG
Mary Thomson, MAG

1. Call to Order

The meeting was called to order by Mr. Tom Canasi, Vice Chairman, at 9:10 a.m. and introductions ensued. Chairman Bilsten then asked Ms. Carolyn McBurney to introduce the Attorney General's Public Awareness Campaign spots. Ms. McBurney noted that the Attorney General's Office Public Awareness Campaign involved all the major television stations in the Valley. Phase I has been completed and distributed to all TV and radio stations. Each television station had an on air news staff in the spot.

Ms. Wambach inquired if the spots had captions for the deaf. Ms. McBurney assured her that they did. She also noted that there are about 50 outdoor billboards have been put up in the community.

2. Approval of the September 7, 2000 Council Meeting Minutes

Chairman Bilsten asked for corrections or additions to the minutes. A Motion to approve was made by Dr. Coonrod and seconded by Ms. McBurney.

3. State Plan Update

Chairman Bilsten introduced Ms. Elizabeth Reich, Director of the Governor's Community Policy Office and Acting Director of the Governor's Office for Domestic Violence Prevention. Ms. Reich

provided an overview of the State Plan Task Force on Domestic Violence and Sexual Assault.

Ms. Reich notified everyone that Hank Barnes is in intensive care at Scottsdale Memorial and asked the Council to keep her in their thoughts.

She then informed the Council that last legislative session there was movement to consolidate all of the domestic violence funds to one or two state departments. As a result, of these conversations a task force to develop state policy was created. The bill mandated a state plan be developed by December 1, 2000. The first meeting of the task force was held in late October.

She noted that this presentation was originally directed to state elected officials who may not be as acquainted with domestic violence as the people on this Council. She reviewed the basic dynamics of domestic violence.

Ms. Reich emphasized that domestic violence is a public health issue not something that happens randomly and we as a society need to begin to treat it as such. Ms. Reich discussed the efforts of the START team whose objective is to build better communication and collaboration amongst the state agencies who fund domestic violence. She also noted the CCRTs in each of the 15 counties who are in process of developing their own plans using the MAG D/V plan as a model.

Ms. Reich noted the areas that needed improvement include evaluation of programs, serving the rural areas, and the validity of data collected. She also discussed the concern about the calls for domestic violence beds and how they are counted. She stated that there is no proof that the funding does not necessarily address the need considering that only 4% of the funding goes to prevention and the majority of funding goes to beds. She indicated that mostly we have been responding to a crisis without any firm policy in place and the funding breakdown reflected as such. One way to begin changing this pattern is to form a comprehensive coordinated response.

The legislation for Senate Bill 1303 calls for outcome goals, identification of needs in the state, gaps in services, available resources, effectiveness and efficiency indicators and a performance based evaluation process for current and future services.

The START Team has begun to develop this by creating a Needs Matrix which Includes Prevention, Early Intervention, Crisis Intervention, Offender Accountability, Victim Awareness and Empowerment and identifying which organizations should be providing these services and how much funding should go towards these areas.

Recommendations for the State Planning Process should include the following:

- Focus on Policy
- Where possible, base recommendations on research
- Inclusive and culturally sensitive
- Establish work groups with membership broader than the Task Force
- Facilitated meetings documented results

Ms. Reich informed the Council that a subcommittee was formed to make recommendation to extend the December 1 deadline to the legislature and recommend a two year process that is funded for it to be a comprehensive and meaningful plan. She likened it to what Deloitte Touche did with Juvenile Justice Planning. A large document that is living and breathing and really valuable in setting the policy direction for the state on this issue. They asked for 500,000 to fund the process. She noted that they are concerned with the alternative fuel vehicles debacle that the funds will be appropriated.

Chairman Bilsten asked how she sees the State Plan process affecting the regional efforts. Ms. Reich noted that she thinks the various regional efforts will more likely affect the state planning process. She has requested the CCRTS develop their own plans and the plans existing in Maricopa, Pima, Yavapai, and Santa Cruz will also be integrating into the state planning process.

She hired Brooke Kirkeide to develop the scope of work to hire the consultant to run the state planing process. The consultant should be on board October 2001. This plan will affect this legislative budget - but the next one.

4. Work Group Report Out

Annual Healthcare Training

Dr. Dean Coonrod acknowledged Sue Hollabough, his co-chair for her assistance with the work group. The group's primary focus is on instituting annual domestic violence training in hospitals to all personnel.

The group surveyed hospitals on their current policies and protocols around domestic violence. Of the results received, 94% supported implementing comprehensive protocols. This was interpreted as good news because it conveyed a certain level of buy-in. The response to the type of assistance needed resulted in the following answers; training, CQI process, continuum of improvement and implementation of protocols.

The third goal of the subcommittee was to determine if there is interest in certification that exceeds the JHACO certification requirements. This certification would signify to the community that they exceed these requirements. Over 60% of those who responded supported the concept.

Dr. Coonrod then stated that the group would try to get support from the CEO's for the concept of a "Family Violence Free Zone". He noted that there was a meeting to gain buy in from a few key CEO's who would then serve as Champions of the initiative to other health care organizations. The champion CEOs would then go on to make a presentation to the Annual Hospital Association meeting in March to get more hospitals on board.

Dr. Coonrod expressed that a group consensus revealed that the protocols need to go beyond domestic violence to address the broader issue of family violence. He asked the council to approve that approach.

Ms. Connie Philips inquired why there was the need to focus on family violence. Dr. Coonrod noted that there is a strong interaction or correlation between child abuse and domestic violence as well as vulnerable populations and domestic violence. By focusing on all three, we will make the protocol more comprehensive.

Ms. Doreen Nicholas stated that the protocol separated each type of violence making domestic violence with it's own separate and defined policy.

Chairman Bilsten asked for a motion to approve incorporating all types of family violence into the medical protocol. Ms. Philips moved and Mr. Kirkeide seconded the motion to broaden the scope of the healthcare protocol to encompass family violence.

City/Local Coordinating Councils on Domestic Violence

Cmdr. Kim Humphrey review the upcoming training for Local Coordinating Councils scheduled for February 6 and 7, 2001 discussed specific around the training. The work group has scheduled a two day training for interested cities - it will be held Feb 6 and 7th – training will take place at AZPost. Approximately 5 cities will be participating: Chandler, Mesa, Northwest Valley, West Valley and— teams will be coming – probably 40-60 people. Our initial goals was to have three teams come. A second training is anticipate for June 30, 2001. We expect to exceed our goal of three teams.

We have a training outline already developed - he referred to the handout in the packet. Chairman Bilsten asked how the cities were invited. She thought that many more would be willing to come. He stated that they are approaching it as a pilot. Mr. Humphrey made a couple of presentation with the League of Cities and towns, and Mary has done much of the leg work. They reviewed the five teams (missed them).

Mr. Humphrey reviewed the list – a rep from prosecution, law enforcement, social services, (see list from other presentation)

motion to move forward on the training: missed who said the motion....

Faith Based Involvement - Deb Lerner

Rev. Deborah Lerner passed around a summary of who attended the faith based conference. First year 120, next year 220, this year 360 attended. She reviewed the list of different religious affiliations - there was extremely diverse attendance. We feel we are penetrating broadly all faith traditions. We are actively developing a more inclusive mail list. We had excellent press coverage - an editorial spot as well. Channel three ran some pieces and a number of the smaller newspapers, as well as a KJAZZ spot. All helped to increase the community consciousness.

the morning session on the criminal justice response was well attended - clergy want to know and need to know the legal issues related to DV.

the feedback was we need to do this again and we need to add additional components. The planning

group is tired but after reading the evaluations they got re-energized. We are going to draw additional congregations to help plan next year's event.

The PM grant will support the creation of a faith-based manual - we have identified an author and an existing manual which will be used as a template. A work group will be gathering to make an outline of the manual. The PM grant will also support next year's conference and requests for follow-up training to congregations. She thanked MAG for its support of the conference.

She noted that on the evaluations that many said I did not know I was a victim until today... She showed the

Chairman Bilsten asked when the Manual will be finished. Lerner noted that it should be finished by July.

Rev. Lerner mentioned that there was excellent turnout. Paul Eppinger hoped that there was some way to expand the conference to a statewide venue, by taking similar efforts across the state. Rev. Lerner mentioned that they were inviting clergy from across the state, and did have some participants from outside the metro area.

Motion: Continue to support the faith based efforts in D.V., this conference. Motion Ms. Loewen, SECONDED BY Kim.. Motion pAAWS.

Legislative Update

The legislative report was given by Kathleen Ferraro. The state plan committee is a benefit and a distraction. We know that the deadline has been extended and that they will request funds for their work. She asked for support for this. She also asked that the Council support increased DV. Funding. Support \$8 million for DES budget, and support legislation requesting an extended period of time along with adequate appropriations to support the development of a comprehensive state plan. The funding will be directed to funding the new beds and maintaining the existing system. They are also requesting an appropriation to fund supervised probation, and supporting creating a state statute to make misdemeanor DV offenders non-bondable if they re-offend while out on misdemeanor release. This would result in incarceration until the case was resolved. There will be a budgeting impact.

Chairman Bilsten asked if there were sponsors. Loren Kirkeide mentioned misdemeanor enhancement and asked how this would impact. John Pombier noted that AZ Foundation for Women and the AG office, the AZ Constitution requires that misdemeanors be bondable. In talking with those groups, a minimum bond amount of \$25,000 cash only may be another route to take. One of the problems with prosecution, is that perpetrator can be back in the system in 24 hours, and the victim loses faith in the system. If we can keep the victim in custody, then the victim remains safer. Diane noted that the cities are transmitting information to the Maricopa Attorney's office so that better information. They are working with the prosecutors to ensure that multiple charges from different jurisdictions are put together so that we can actually get to the felony level. Kim asked if this is being done on a statewide level. Is there some way to capture this statewide. At the Governor's Legislative Forum, this was asked repeatedly. How are we going to track this

statewide - remains a problem.

Peggy noted that she hears this as a problem, but no solutions. It seems to be a computer problem - with systems not able to talk to each other. CIDVIC and AOC is trying to get the courts on the same system to report the convictions. If the courts can do this, we are halfway there. Peggy noted that we must find an answer. Loren suggested that we use the Internet for data entry, and then the system doesn't matter. You don't have to have all the case details, but just enough information to allow information to be shared. Carolyn McBurney noted that this information had been shared in previous meetings. Peggy volunteered to chair a subcommittee to focus on this. Kim noted that this same issues existed for DUI. This issue has been solved for the DUI issue. Someone has to tell the courts and the police departments that they must share the information.

Woman from audience - adult probation is encountering problems with supervised probation for misdemeanor cases. Some of smaller jurisdictions don't have jail space to incarcerate those who violate. Therefore there are not consequences. We must advocate for funding for small jurisdictions to jail the violators or to pay Maricopa County to provide this service. (Lynn Potts, Mesa City Prosecutor) John Pombier also stated that without enforceable consequences, the authority of the probation officer is jeopardized. Tom Canasi noted that Tempe does provide supervised probation. The County Attorney's Office came out with Protocols, which were unfunded. Many of the jurisdictions figured out how to fund these. If we don't fund supervised probations, the perpetrators will be back out on the street. Communication between and within jurisdictions is critical. People are not talking to each other - Tempe is working on this issue within its city.

Motion: Tom proposed forming a group to look at centralized repository for those who have committed a dv offense. Kim moved setting up the subcommittee. Domestic violence is not a crime - it is a relationship. It is an aggravated assault. That is the snag. He also volunteered. Rev. Lerner seconded the motion. Peggy noted that we need to find a legislative state champion.

Kathleen asked for a small technical change. Dianne Post is the new legislative person at ACADV. Kathleen volunteered her for the 132915 - small change in state statute related to yielding your line in a party line situation. Will propose legislation to remove party line language in the statute. Mary will e-mail the list of legislators. Please contact them before the session so they are aware hat funding is needed for the shelters. In the packet is a list of unmet needs - beyond beds. The fact sheet will help communicate with the legislators.

Motion to support legislative agenda: Peggy suggested sending phones, faxes and e-mails to let the legislators. Carolyn and Connie moved and seconded. Motion passed.

5. Employers Against Domestic Violence

Tracy Bame and Gene D'Adamo co-chair the committee. She recognized the employers: CASA, Sojourner, ACADV, AG, Gov Officer, MAG, PD, Rep., Suns, SRP, AMEX...

Met November 8 to develop a plan of action. She summarized the mission statement (insert).

: She reviewed the four goals: develop a workplace violence prevention model etc; to build alliances with targeted domestic violence services providers whose primary mission is to provider DV services; to provide educational resources to the employer community on the issue of DV and raise

awareness among employers and their employees; and to develop a unified fund-raising event to address the issue of DV and rally support of individuals and employers in the community.

EADV has established four subcommittees: Workplace Training (Mary Thomson and employer), External Alliances (racy and Connie); Education and Resources (Tom Ambrose and Loren Kirkeide); and fund-raising event (Gene and Paul Oves).

They will be asking others to join and help with the goals.

Peggy complimented Tracy and the group for their accomplishments.

Motion to endorse and accept: Dean, Leach. Motion passed

Call to the Public

Announcements

Due to the late time, the other agenda items were deferred until the next meeting.

Peggy thanked everyone for their work. She complimented everyone on all of the actions taken in the year. MAG has contracted with Linda Kmetz to help with the coordinated community response. Next meeting Feb 8 from January 18. Notice to be sent. She wished everyone a happy holiday.

Council member Garcia informed the committee that Guadalupe is moving into their new town hall and the Council voted the old town hall will be a youth town hall. This would offer them an opportunity to tackle issues such as violence, newspaper - to enhance their status within the town. Putting responsibility on the youth will help to address D.V. Youth are seldom recognized and do not come forward with their problems of violence. Runaways, violence are often unreported. She will inform the members of the committee when the groundbreaking occurs.

Meeting adjourned 11:00am

6. Employers Against Domestic Violence (EADV)
7. Proposed Formation of an Ad Hoc Strategy Planning Work Group and a Finance Work Group
8. Domestic Violence Continuum of Care Services
9. Call to the Public
10. Announcements
11. Adjourn